Intentionality and Structure in Discourse Relations

Proceedings of a Workshop
Sponsored by the
Special Interest Group on Generation of the
Association for Computational Linguistics

Edited by
Owen Rambow

21 June 1993
Ohio State University
Columbus, Ohio, USA
Intentionality and Structure in Discourse Relations

Proceedings of a Workshop
Sponsored by the
Special Interest Group on Generation of the
Association for Computational Linguistics

Edited by
Owen Rambow

21 June 1993
Ohio State University
Columbus, Ohio, USA

Published by the Association for Computational Linguistics
Preface

Generating multi-sentential text requires the ability to compose individual clauses into larger units, a process called text planning. Clearly, text planning is an important component of our linguistic competence: we do not always communicate by single, isolated, clause-sized utterances. Two approaches to this question in the field of text generation have proved seminal: McKeown's 1982 thesis, in which she uses rhetorical schemata to represent typical domain-independent text structures, and the text planners under development at ISI since 1988 under the direction of Ed Hovy, which use plan operators based on Mann and Thompson's Rhetorical Structure Theory (RST) in a STRIPS-like planning architecture. What these two approaches have in common is the term "rhetorical" and the claim that they are domain-independent architectures. While they have spawned a large number of approaches, architectures, systems, and theories, there has been a general undercurrent of dissatisfaction with things "rhetorical"; for example, various discourse phenomena have been identified in the literature that specific theories (usually, RST) cannot handle, or cannot handle elegantly. Furthermore, researchers in discourse analysis (as opposed to text generation) have by and large ignored rhetorical approaches, or brushed them off as insignificant, often arguing that rhetorical relations are an epiphenomenon of deeper relations between communicative intentions. This widespread use of, and simultaneous dislike of, rhetorical relations has motivated this workshop. If a theory of rhetorical relations is useful (or required?) for text planning, then it must contain some useful insight. If such theories are disliked, then present theories of rhetorical relations (such as RST) need to be improved, or perhaps completely reworked. In order to approach these tasks, a clearer understanding of the underlying theoretical issues is required. The goal of the workshop is to bring together researchers from different fields, including discourse understanding, discourse generation, and linguistic discourse analysis, and to discuss the relationship between discourse relations, intentions, and the representation of the discourse participants' beliefs, desires, and intentions. The hope is that a lively discussion will help identify useful insights that should be retained, and obvious errors that should be avoided, in future theories of discourse structure.

I would like to thank the members of the organizing committee, Judy Delin, Ed Hovy, and Johanna Moore, for reviewing all submissions and for their extensive help in the organization of the workshop; the ACL, for financial support; the Institute for Research in Cognitive Science at the University of Pennsylvania, for logistical support; Terry Patten, for local organization help; and Don Walker, for help with everything from sending out the Call for Papers to printing these proceedings.

Owen Rainbow
Chair, Organizing Committee
# Table of Contents

**Rhetorical Relations: Necessary But Not Sufficient**  
Sandra Carberry, Jennifer Chu, Nancy Green, & Lynn Lambert ......................... I

**Rhetoric and Intentions in Discourse**  
Robert Dale ............................................................................ 5

**Knowledge, Intention, Rhetoric: Levels of Variation in Multilingual Instructions**  
Judy Delin, Donia Scott, & Tony Hartley ............................................ 7

**Speaker’s Intentions and Beliefs in Negative Imperatives**  
Barbara Di Eugenio ................................................................... 11

**A Goal-Based Grammar of Rhetoric**  
Chrysanne DiMarco, Graeme Hirst, & Marzena Makuta-Giluk ..................... 15

**An Algorithm for High-Level Organization of Multi-Paragraph Texts**  
Robert Granville ...................................................................... 19

**Planning for Intentions with Rhetorical Relations**  
Susan Hailer ............................................................................ 23

**Structuring Two-Medium Dialog for Learning Language and Other Things**  
Henry Hamburger, Dan Tufis, & Raza Hashim ......................................... 27

**From Planning to Actions: Realizing Intentions by Rhetorical Means**  
Helmut Horacek ....................................................................... 31

**In Defense of Syntax: Informational, Intentional, and Rhetorical Structures in Discourse**  
Eduard Hovy .......................................................................... 35

**Observations and Directions in Text Structure**  
John Hughes & Kathleen McCoy ...................................................... 40

**“Act promptly, make your god happy”: Representation and Rhetorical Relations in Natural Language Generation**  
Margaret Hundleby .................................................................... 44

**Using Cue Phrases to Determine Rhetorical Relations**  
Alistair Knott .......................................................................... 48

**Towards Stratification of RST**  
Tanya Korelsky & Richard Kittredge ................................................... 52

**Domain-Dependent and Domain-Independent Rhetorical Relations**  
Jong-Gyun Lim ....................................................................... 56
Empirical Evidence for Intention-Based Discourse Segmentation
Diane J. Litman & Rebecca J. Passonneau ............................................. 60

The Need for Intentionally-Based Approaches to Language
Karen Lochbaum .......................................................... .......................... 64

Intentions in Bilingual Dialogue Processing
Susann LuperFoy ........................................................................ 68

The Representation of Interdependencies between Communicative Goals and Rhetorical Relations in the Framework of Multimedia Document Generation
Elisabeth Maier ........................................................................ 70

On Structure and Intention
Mark Maybury ........................................................................ 71

Textual Constraints, Rhetorical Relations and Communicative Intentions in PLANDoc Narratives
Kathleen McKeown & Karen Kukich .................................................. 78

Assumption Underlying Discourse Relations: Which Ones are Really There and Where are They?
Marie Meteer ........................................................................ 82

How Could Rhetorical Relations Be Used in Machine Translation? (And at Least Two Open Questions)
Ruslan Mitkov ........................................................................ 86

On the Necessity of Intentions and (at Least) the Usefulness of Rhetorical Relations: A Position Paper
Vibhu Mittal & Cécile Paris .......................................................... 90

Investigating Discourse Relations
Megan Moser & Johanna Moore ........................................................ 94

Intentions, Information, and Inference: Two Rhetorical Questions
Jon Oberlander ........................................................................ 98

Rhetoric as Knowledge
Owen Rainbow ........................................................................ 102

Intentions, Rhetoric, or Discourse Relations? A Case from Multilingual Document Generation
Dietmar Rösner ........................................................................ 106

A Model of Speech Act Planner Adapted to Multilingual Universes
Daniel Rousseau, Guy Lapalme, & Bernard Moulin ........................................ 110

On the Cognitive and Text-Analytic Status of Coherence Relations
Ted Sanders ........................................................................ 114
Domain Structure, Rhetorical Structure, and Text Structure
Penelope Sibun ................................................................. 118

On Discourse Relations, Rhetorical Relations and Rhetoric
Candace Sidner ............................................................... 122

Summarising as a Lever for Studying Large-Scale Discourse Structure
Karen Sparck Jones ......................................................... 125

The Multifaceted Organization of Discourse
Dan Suthers ....................................................................... 128

Rhetorical Relations, Action and Intentionality in Conversation
David Traum ...................................................................... 132

Intentionality in a Topical Approach of Discourse Structure
Jan van Kuppevelt ............................................................. 136

Rhetorical Relations in Instructional Text Generation
Keith Vander Linden ......................................................... 140

Information and Deliberation in Discourse
Marilyn Walker ............................................................... 144

Issues in Linguistic Segmentation
Janice Wiebe ..................................................................... 148

Closing the Gap Between Discourse Structure and Communicative Intention
Paul Wu Horng Jyh .......................................................... 152